

Cao 1

Olivia Cao

Professor Clark

Writing 5: Image and Text

27 February 2025

### Reading Between the Lines:

#### Contextualizing JMW Turner's *The Slave Ship* Within and Independently of

#### Claudia Rankine's *Citizen: An American Lyric*

They say a picture is worth a thousand words. From paintings outcompeting their descriptions to stock photos dominating a PowerPoint slide, a hundred interpretations can be bundled into a singular image. Claudia Rankine leverages this power in her book *Citizen: An American Lyric*, supplementing her race-driven critique of the modern world with selected images. To some extent, that impact is realized: through her purposeful placement of images, Rankine makes the moral wrongness of modern racial conditions evident. At the same time, however, Rankine's use of images alongside her poetry "reduce[s] the conceptual richness of these works" (Zuromskis). By recontextualizing them within the lens of her narrative on racial struggle, Rankine dilutes the pictures to just that: a conversation about victimization. The pictures are stripped of their larger or more tangential meanings. Nowhere is this effect clearer than in the analysis of Joseph Mallord William Turner's 1840 painting entitled *The Slave Ship*. Removed from Rankine's surrounding text and informed with background research, the painting shifts from a passive depiction of racial violence to a vengeful call to action. As Rankine's *Citizen* recontextualizes *The Slave Ship* within her racial narrative, she highlights the strengths and limitations of images when they are used in conjunction with text.

Formatted: Header, Right: 0.25"

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman

Deleted: OUTLINE

INTRO:

Introduce image

Introduce Rankine's work + image

Introduce argument →

Does the image within the context of *Citizen* reduce or enhance the image? ... [1]

Deleted: &

Deleted: 13

Formatted: Font color: Black

Deleted: Paper 2: Rough Draft ... [2]

Deleted: , a hundred messages and interpretations bundled ... [3]

Deleted: ,

Deleted: — captions hanging loose at the corners.

Deleted: that

Deleted: novel

Deleted: — everything from photos to paintings to ... [4]

Deleted: in

Commented [OMC1]: Could be rephrased with strong ... [5]

Deleted: the message in Rankine's text is amplified,

Deleted: made

Deleted: Catherine Zuromskis was in part correct when ... [6]

Deleted: tends to

Commented [OMC2]: Pull quotation from class reading ... [7]

Deleted: In

Deleted: specific

Deleted: reduces

Deleted: images

Deleted: race.

Commented [OMC3]: Not just a dilution but an alteration ... [8]

Deleted: that

Deleted: more clear

Deleted: ,

Deleted: Whether through

Deleted: or even the simple act of removal from Rankine's ... [9]

Deleted: exposes far more nuance.

Deleted: simultaneously aligns with and isolates the ... [10]

Formatted: Font: Not Italic

Commented [OMC4]: Duality - adds depth/nuance ... [11]

Deleted: image

Formatted: Footer

In the final pages of *Citizen*, Rankine frames racial experience through a lens of perpetual suffering. With written imagery that combines the emotional and physical tolls of racism, Rankine characterizes the African American experience as a disempowerment. Rankine comments that the Black American's outside "blister[s] the inside," that the racist insults trap them "in a chokehold, every part roughed up" (Rankine 158). She transforms the idea of racism into a physical predator capable of delivering both internal and external injury. The African American is overwhelmingly victimized, and we too, through Rankine's pointed use of the second person, are made victims by proxy. As Rankine continues, writing, "I don't know how to end what doesn't have an ending," she extends that state of victimhood from one of temporary incapacitation to perpetual struggle (Rankine 159). Not only is Rankine powerless in preventing the pain of racial discrimination, but she also cannot end *Citizen* with finality when all evidence of modern racism points to its continuation. Instead of ending hopefully as another narrative might, then, Rankine resurrects the familiar discomfort of microaggression – "the same fundamental misperception happen[ing] again and again" – used throughout *Citizen*: a woman who purposefully moves her car to the other end of the parking lot after making eye contact with the speaker (Young). Similarly, the sunrise she alludes to, a symbol of coming change, is reluctant: "slow and cloudy, dragging the light in, but barely" (Rankine 159). As she finishes with "It wasn't a match...It was a lesson," Rankine leaves us with the reality of racism's underlying and pervasive ceaselessness: racism is not a one-time competition to be "won," but rather a continuous education, an uphill war that must be endured (Rankine 159). By contextualizing the painting within this narrative of perpetuity, Rankine narrows the interpretation of *The Slave Ship* to one of racial struggle. In the last pages of *Citizen*, we are met with the full image of Turner's *The Slave Ship*. At first glance, it's beautiful. The painting is

**Deleted:** Within the context of *Citizen*, Rankine amplifies the racial interpretation of *The Slave Ship*, revealing the cyclical pattern of horror and pain ingrained in the African American experience. With the purposeful layout of the page, the viewer's initial impression of the painting is one of beauty: a vibrant sunset painted in streaky gold, beautifully hazy in the nature-loving style of the impressionists. Yet as Rankine crops the image of the painting to a single shackled leg, thrashing as its flesh is swarmed by white fish, the brutal injury that was present all along is brought to center stage and emphasized with distinct clarity.

**Formatted:** Indent: First line: 0", Don't adjust right indent when grid is defined, Don't adjust space between Latin and Asian text, Don't adjust space between Asian text and numbers

**Formatted:** Footer

Cao 3

dominated by a sunset or sunrise depicted in wisps of gold, orange, and red so bright that the bottom half of the painting is almost lost. Even if the viewer looks to the bottom of the image, the details are indistinct: the distant shadow of a ship, an ocean foaming with dark waves, the sun's reflection glinting off the water. Yet, as Rankine crops the image to a shackled leg swarmed by white fish, the brutal assault that was present all along is emphasized with a visceral clarity. The other elements — sky, ship, the majority of the sea — are excised from the picture, and we come face to face with undeniable evidence of atrocity. First exhibited at London's Royal Academy in conjunction with an Anti-Slavery League meeting, *The Slave Ship* is already rooted in a defiance of racial subjugation (Marcuse). In cropping the image to center on the ruination of a human life, Rankine narrows that focus to the victimization of the African American experience, confronting those audiences who deny the suffering of African Americans. In using Turner's painting — created by a man who, even in the 1800s, rejected the opportunity to ignore the slave trade's horrific practices — Rankine urges us to do the same: "I wanted to end [Citizen] with Turner because people always say, 'Well, I didn't know. It wasn't my intention. I wish I had known more about this,'" she said. "But Turner knew better" ("Claudia Rankine's *Citizen*").

While Rankine primarily draws on *The Slave Ship's* undertones of racial victimization, the painting as an independent artwork explores further nuances. In examining those lenses, the narrative of the African American experience transforms from one of victimhood to one of retribution. Even in the original title of the painting — "Slavers Throwing Overboard the Dead and Dying - Typho[o]n Coming On" — Turner builds beyond the suffering that Rankine fixates on ("*Slave Ship*"). By placing the typhoon and the slavers within the descriptor of the painting, Turner asserts that the slaves are not the only subjects; the slavers, ship, and storm are active agents as well. Though Rankine amputates it from her cropped picture, the slave ship, presumed

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman

Formatted: Header, Right: 0.25"

Commented [OMC6]: Note: this seems like a visual reflection of Rankine's invocation of sunrise in the preceding text.

Deleted: at the same time as a meeting of the ...n conjunction with an Anti-Slavery League and inspired by the Zong Massacre, a key event in the abolition movement in which slavers threw slaves overboard to collect insurance money...eeting, *The Slave Ship* is already rooted in an exploration... defiance of racial themes; with her formatting of the image, Rankine elevates that aspect of racial cr... [12]

Commented [OMC7]: Add historical context to highlight Rankine's alignment and divergence from interpretation of painting on its own.

Deleted: She accomplishes what Turner — himself an influential force behind the anti-slavery movement — accomplished when he painted *The Slave Ship* 185 years ago: confronts and accuses... cropping the image to center on the ruination of a human life, Rankine narrows that focus to the victimization of the African American experience, confronting those audiences who would ...eny the suffering of African Americans (Marcuse)... In using Turner's image — someone ... [13]

Deleted: understood and

Deleted: be willfully blind to

Formatted: Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

Formatted: Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

Formatted ... [14]

Commented [OMC8]: Alignment with painting on its own: Rankine's choice to end on painting amplifies certain elements of painting (reminder, resistance)

Deleted: (... "Claudia Rankine's *Citizen*"). ... [15]

Formatted: Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

Deleted: In this case, however, Rankine takes the racial aspect of interpretation one step further, not just amplifying the racial interpretation of *The Slave Ship* but indeed combining it within a historical narrative. The painting is a historical instance of racial inequality, not just in the sense of Turner's depiction of the slave trade, but also as a representation of the Zong Massacre. As Rankine then embeds the image within her stories of modern racism, Rankine cultivates this idea of cyclicity. Whether as ... [16]

Formatted: Font: Not Italic

Deleted: representation of slave ...ffering that Rankine fixates on (Slavers Throwing Overboard the Dead and ... [17]

Commented [OMC9]: Cropping as a form of Rankine's tailoring (fitting image to own intended message w... [18]

Deleted: in the background of the painting,

Formatted: Footer

Cao 4

to be the same one that threw the slaves overboard, appears to be crashing headlong into a storm.

Its sails remain unfurled, as if resigned to its inevitable collision with the wave. Contrary to

Rankine's contextualization, the painting embodies not just the conflict of man against man —

slaver against slave — but also of man against nature. As we perceive the connection between

the slavers' crimes and the resultant storm, the storm becomes an intervention; nature acts as

judge, jury, and executioner over mankind's crimes. In this, our position as viewers shifts. As we

are physically positioned closer to the slave bodies than the ship via artistic perspective and

poised to watch the slavers receive just punishment. Turner's composition sides us both literally

and figuratively with the slaves. Where Rankine's emphasis on the shackled leg alludes to racial

struggle, the painting then assumes a greater vengeance. Turner condemns the slave industry as

disgraceful and unnatural, uniting us in a thirst for justice.

Rankine's recontextualization of *The Slave Ship* is not just limited to racial focus,

however; by characterizing racism as a timeless conflict, she integrates the painting into a

historical cycle. As she writes "for it to be like this to have so many memories and no other

memory than these for as long as they can be remembered to remember this," Rankine's

language betrays a ceaselessness to the racial experience (Rankine 158). The lack of punctuation

in a singular line, the cumulative effect of "memory" and "memories," "remembered," and

"remember" is exhausting. Just as there is no reprieve between the racial insults within an

individual's lifetime, we too are given no chance for breath. Yet, the quotation also assumes a

meaning beyond the individual: there is no rest between the constant onslaught of injustices

within African American history. With the line "that time and that time and that time, the outside

blistered the inside of you, words outmaneuvered years," Rankine expands the scope of the racial

struggle (Rankine 158). She repeats "that time," describes how racist insults defy time by

Formatted: Header, Right: 0.25"

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman

Deleted: to have thrown

Deleted: The

Deleted: then becomes,

Deleted: a pitting

Deleted: Indeed, as

Deleted: that

Deleted: not just a coincidence, but an act of

Deleted: , painting

Deleted: As viewers, our proximity to the dying reinforces our sympathy for the victims of the slavers; Turner's organization places us both literally and figuratively on the side of the slaves, and unlike the slaves, we are

Deleted: as

Deleted: at the hands of nature. In this,

Formatted: Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

Formatted: Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

Commented [OMC10]: Contrast to the ambiguity of Rankine's ending. Rankine as representation of continued, tiresome battle against racism, lack of distinct ending; Turner as vengeance, has much more explicit ending - death via storm.

Moved down [1]: / Where is thy market now?"

Deleted: a whole as quite literally against nature, and we too become united with him in our desire to seek

Deleted: Combined with the knowledge of the Zong Massacre — from which the painting drew inspiration — and lines from Turner's poem that was originally paired with *The Slave Ship* — "Hope, Hope, fallacious Hope!"

Deleted: — Turner's painting becomes a political attack (Slavers Throwing Overboard the Dead and Dying, Typhoon Coming On). It incriminates, not just the slavers who perpetuated the horrific atrocities of the slave trade, but the society that would continue to reap rewards from the suffering of human beings. While Rankine's alteration of the image proves effective in her focus on the African American experience, then, Turner's political criticism and the aspect of vengeance contained within the painting is removed in the process.

Formatted: Font color: Black

Deleted: Recognizing this interpretation and

Commented [OMC11]: Structure balances between strategies Rankine uses to reinforce her interpretation ... [19]

Commented [OMC12]: Ceaselessness of experier ... [20]

Formatted: Footer

"outmaneuver[ing] years." In this, racism becomes not only a persistent individual wound but a timeless one. The consequences of racial microaggressions, Rankine says, leave traces beyond their moment of injury and are preserved in memory. As Black Americans assume the scars of their own racist experiences (as well as their ancestors'), then, they become vessels for both individual and intergenerational trauma.

By using *The Slave Ship* as a point of connection between "twenty-first century 'society' [and] the unending legacy of slavery," Rankine imposes that same idea of timeless struggle onto the painting (Young). Indeed, Turner's brutal depiction of the transatlantic slave trade is not just a picture but a historical example of unending racial violence. As Rankine embeds the image within her accounts of modern racism, she "create[s] a sense of historical continuity between the text's portrayal of present-day racism and America's past" (Direkoglu). Whether as a painting, inclusion in *Citizen*, or afterimage in our memories, Turner's painting immortalizes the scene of the shackled leg in perpetual struggle. As we view the painting, we share the same horror that Turner experienced when he painted the gruesome scene, even so many years later. The racial narrative is, in effect, cyclical. *The Slave Ship*, our interpretation of it, and the pain that it depicts can no longer exist independently of history. Entwined within Rankine's continuous fight to combat racism, the painting becomes less an individual moment of atrocity than one example within an endless pattern of them. It acts not only as incontrovertible proof of African American injustice but as a reminder that the pain of the African American experience is not isolated; it is a remnant of bloody legacy, a product of historical tragedy.

In recasting *The Slave Ship* as just another exemplification of racial inequality, however, Rankine removes the unique historical importance of the image. The scene in Turner's work is not just any depiction of the Atlantic slave trade; it is an image of the Zong Massacre. The event,

Commented [OMC13]: Bridge between Rankine's text on modern experience and Turner's historical painting.

Commented [OMC14]: Note that this can have different effects: one horror amongst many = desensitization or amplification? Do we become more and less affected by depictions of racist atrocities the more instances and/or the more often we're presented with them?

Commented [OMC15]: Historical cyclicity vs historical individuality. When we look at history from a broader scale, struck more with cumulative effect of historical events vs the part each event has to play within the narrative.

Formatted: Footer

in which slavers threw approximately 122 slaves overboard (with another ten “jumping on their own accord”) in order to collect insurance money, was pivotal in the British abolition movement. That the subsequent trial considered “enslaved people...the same as any other cargo” and found the insurance company liable for damages ignited a public discourse that gave British abolitionist leaders the momentum needed to propel the movement (History.com Editors). Combining this knowledge with lines from Turner’s poem that was originally paired with *The Slave Ship* — “Hope, Hope, fallacious Hope! / Where is thy market now?” — Turner’s painting then becomes a political attack (“Slave Ship”). It paints slavery as a monstrosity, a desecrator of hope. It incriminates both the slavers who perpetuated the horrific atrocities of the slave trade as well as the society that continued to reap rewards from human suffering. While Rankine’s alteration of the image proves effective in her focus on African American adversity, Turner’s specific political criticism within the painting, the historical significance of the event are removed in the process. Instead of fully recognizing the suffering directly experienced by these 132 slaves, she reduces the image to one nameless instance of racial violence amongst a history of them.

When understood within these historical and analytical lenses and recontextualized within *Citizen, The Slave Ship*, and, in turn, the end to Rankine’s narrative, assume new meaning as a general call for resistance. Whether reading only the text of Rankine’s *Citizen* or viewing *The Slave Ship* as an independent work of art, both invoke sympathy, empathy, even anger. By combining the powerful history and vengeful message of *The Slave Ship* with the broader scope of Rankine’s depiction of continuous racial violence, Turner’s painting transforms into a lesson in resilience. The success of the abolition movement as an indirect result of the Zong Massacre is proof that change, though “slow and cloudy,” is still possible (Rankine 159). The slave ship, moments away from being crushed in the background of their crimes, reminds us that justice is

**Moved (insertion) [1]**

**Deleted:** within *Citizen, The Slave Ship* assumes new meaning, not just as a depiction of atrocity but a call for resistance. ....

**Commented [OMC16]:** Underlying question: historical erasure or method of sparking intrigue so that readers will be more inclined to research the painting and the historical events being represented in the art?

**Commented [OMC17]:** Use structure to reinforce line of thinking: what Rankine does (and how that affects interpretation of the painting), interpretation of *Slave Ship* independently, strength that comes from synthesizing both interpretations

**Commented [OMC18R17]:** Small-scoped: Rankine (macro interpretation), Turner (micro interpretation) Broad-scoped: synthesize both = appreciation of all nuances while adding depth to “takeaway”

**Formatted:** Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

**Deleted:** Yet there’s also a sense of inaction and, perhaps, helplessness. As viewers of a painting or readers of stories, we can only do so much. Yet as we begin to understand the full weight of the painting’s background — humans becoming victims not just of violent circumstance but greed — and the full picture of the painting’s composition, those injustices of *The Slave Ship*’s depictions inform our interpretation of both image and text. When we reconceive those injustices with Rankine’s words — “The sunrise and

**Deleted:** , dragging the light in, but barely” — that helplessness is transformed into something more akin to uprising, to hope. The drowning body, the flesh-eating fish become reminders — “a lesson” — that through struggle and violence, the fight continues.

**Formatted:** Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

**Formatted:** Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

**Deleted:** acts as a reminder that, in spite of tragedy,

**Formatted:** Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

**Formatted:** Footer

alive and attainable. The shackled leg may be struggling, yes, but it continues to fight; it is no passive victim but proof of active persistence. Taken as a whole, *The Slave Ship* is metamorphosed; it becomes a challenge to fulfill our responsibility as witnesses — “to be marked; we should not leave it unscathed” — and from that experience, derive the strength to retain awareness, resist ignorance, and remain resolute in the battle for equality (Aziza).

A picture may be worth a thousand words, but in Rankine’s *Citizen*, only so many of those words, those interpretations, make an appearance. Framed within Rankine’s race-conscious narrative, images like *The Slave Ship* are easily cast within strict boundaries, “steamroll[ing] the potential complexities” (Zuromskis). In this sense, Zuromskis’s critique of Rankine’s use of images holds water. Without knowing about the Zong Massacre, Turner’s original title for the painting or his accompanying poem, without giving further thought to the storm Rankine amputated from the image, the comprehensive intention of the artist is lost. Rankine crafts a cohesive racial narrative, yes, but at the expense of the politics, background, and history underlying *The Slave Ship*. Yet, it is in understanding these nuances that we can interpret *The Slave Ship* in its most dynamic forms — accusation, historical struggle, an expression of tenacity. By considering context each time we view an artwork, we as viewers can ensure those interpretations are perceived and begin to defy the characterization of the “passive, comprehensible, and straightforward” image (Zuromskis). Through Rankine’s use of *The Slave Ship*, we realize the transformative power of context in shaping image; integrating image within text constructs one narrative, interpreting the image on its own creates another, but through the combination of the two, the image can, as in the case of *The Slave Ship*, achieve greater depth as an active message.

Formatted: Header, Right: 0.25"

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman

Deleted: still possible.

Deleted: then

Formatted: Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

Formatted

... [21]

Deleted: transformed

Deleted: as

Formatted: Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

Formatted: Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

Deleted: (Aziza)

Formatted: Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

Commented [OMC19]: Important to remember that onus of interpretation is on the viewer; we are meant to be affected. So what role do we or can we play in Rankine's and Turner's message?

Deleted: reaffirm hope.

Commented [OMC20]: Callback to intro

Formatted: Space After: 0 pt

Formatted: Font: Not Italic

Deleted: at least, Catherine Zuromskis

Commented [OMC21]: Reinvoke impetus for argument - ground paper in a very full-circle way

Deleted: or... Turner's original title for the painting and...r his accompanying poem, without giving further thoug ... [22]

Commented [OMC22]: Understanding of singular ... [23]

Formatted

... [24]

Commented [OMC23]: Extend argument beyond ... [28]

Deleted: "; whether understood as an isolated

Deleted: or an element of Rankine's *Citizen*, interpre ... [26]

Deleted: image then,...he *Slave Ship*, we realize the ... [29]

Formatted

... [25]

Formatted

... [27]

Formatted

... [30]

Deleted: alongside

Deleted: another, value in

Deleted: , and even...creates another, but through the ... [33]

Formatted

... [31]

Formatted

... [32]

Formatted: Footer

## WORKS CITED

Aziza, Sarah. "The Work of the Witness." *Jewish Currents*, 12 January 2024. PDF file.

"Claudia Rankine's *Citizen*." *Radio Open Source*, 2025.

<https://radioopensource.org/claudia-rankine/>. Accessed 26 Feb. 2025.

Direkoglu, Daniel. "Anguish in Language: Pain as a Biocultural Experience in Claudia Rankine's *Citizen: An American Lyric*." *Literature and Medicine*, vol. 41, no. 2, Fall 2023, pp. 331-356. *Project MUSE*, <https://dx.doi.org/10.1353/lm.2023.a921566>. Accessed 26 Feb. 2025.

History.com Editors. "Zong slave ship trial: insurance loss or mass murder?" *HISTORY, A&E Television Networks*, 20 June 2024.  
<https://www.history.com/this-day-in-history/zong-slave-ship-trial>. Accessed 26 Feb. 2025.

Marcuse, Harold. "Turner's 'The Slaveship'." *UC Santa Barbara*.

<https://marcuse.faculty.history.ucsb.edu/classes/4c/turner.004.htm>. Accessed 26 Feb. 2025.

Rankine, Claudia. *Citizen: An American Lyric*. Graywolf Press, 2014.

"Slave Ship (Slavers Throwing Overboard the Dead and Dying, Typhoon Coming On)." *MFA Boston*, 2025.

<https://collections.mfa.org/objects/31102/slave-ship-slavers-throwing-overboard-the-dead-and-dying-t>. Accessed 26 Feb. 2025.

Young, John K. "Violence and Memory in the Multiple Versions of Claudia Rankine's *Citizen*." *Transatlantica*, The French Association for American Studies,  
<https://journals.openedition.org/transatlantica/23278>. Accessed 26 Feb. 2025.

Formatted: Header, Right: 0.25"

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman

Formatted: Font color: Auto

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Formatted: Ligatures: None

Formatted

... [34]

Deleted: ¶

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Deleted: 13

Formatted

... [36]

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Formatted

... [37]

Formatted

... [35]

Deleted: ¶

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Formatted

... [38]

Deleted:

Deleted: 13

Formatted

... [39]

Formatted

... [40]

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.5"

Field Code Changed

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Formatted: Font color: Auto, Ligatures: None

Deleted: ¶

Deleted:

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Formatted: Font color: Black

Deleted: <https://www.mfa.org>.

Formatted: Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

Formatted: Normal, Level 2, Indent: Left: 0.56"

Deleted: 13

Formatted: Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

Formatted: Font: 18 pt, Bold

Deleted: ¶

Formatted: Footer

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman

Formatted: Header, Right: 0.25"

Zuromskis, Catherine. "Complicating Images." *Reconsidering Claudia Rankine's Citizen: An American Lyric. A symposium, Part II*, 7 Jan 2016. *Los Angeles Review of Books*.

Deleted:

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Deleted: ,

Deleted: <https://lareviewofbooks.org/article/reconsidering-claudia-rankines-citizen-an-american-lyric-a-symposium-part-ii/>

Deleted: . Accessed 13 Feb 2025.

Formatted: Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

Formatted: Font color: Auto, Ligatures: None

Formatted: Indent: First line: 0.5", Automatically adjust right indent when grid is defined, Adjust space between Latin and Asian text, Adjust space between Asian text and numbers

Formatted: Line spacing: Multiple 1.16 li

<https://lareviewofbooks.org/article/reconsidering-claudia-rankines-citizen-an-american-lyric-a-symposium-part-ii/>. Accessed 26 Feb. 2025.

Formatted: Footer

|                     |               |                      |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 1: [1] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                     |               |                      |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 1: [2] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                     |               |                      |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 1: [3] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                     |               |                      |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 1: [4] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                              |               |                     |
|------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|
| Page 1: [5] Commented [OMC1] | Olivia M. Cao | 12/19/25 9:23:00 AM |
|------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|

Could be rephrased with stronger wording. Passive voice-adjacent.

|                     |               |                      |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 1: [6] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                              |               |                     |
|------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|
| Page 1: [7] Commented [OMC2] | Olivia M. Cao | 12/19/25 9:22:00 AM |
|------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|

Pull quotation from class readings - engagement with core course concepts (evaluation of image and text independently and alongside one another).

|                              |               |                     |
|------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|
| Page 1: [8] Commented [OMC3] | Olivia M. Cao | 12/19/25 9:20:00 AM |
|------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|

Not just a dilution but an alteration to the photo's identity. Identify that the pictures have underlying meanings broader than the one Rankine foregrounds.

|                     |               |                      |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 1: [9] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|---------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 1: [10] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                               |               |                     |
|-------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|
| Page 1: [11] Commented [OMC4] | Olivia M. Cao | 12/19/25 9:21:00 AM |
|-------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|

Duality - adds depth/nuance to argument while also laying foundation for clear structure.

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [12] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼.....

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [12] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼.....

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [12] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼.....

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [12] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼.....

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [13] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼.....

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [13] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼.....

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [13] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼.....

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [13] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼.....

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [14] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

▼.....

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [14] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

▼.....

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [15] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [15] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|



|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [16] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|



|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [16] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|



|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [16] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|



|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [16] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|



|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [16] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|



|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [17] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|



|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [17] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|



|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [17] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|



|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [17] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|



|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [17] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [17] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [17] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [17] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [17] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [17] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 3: [17] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                               |               |                     |
|-------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|
| Page 3: [18] Commented [OMC9] | Olivia M. Cao | 12/19/25 9:32:00 AM |
|-------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|

Cropping as a form of Rankine's tailoring (fitting image to own intended message while losing other nuances).

|                                |               |                     |
|--------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|
| Page 4: [19] Commented [OMC11] | Olivia M. Cao | 12/19/25 3:09:00 PM |
|--------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|

Structure balances between strategies Rankine uses to reinforce her interpretation, how that affects interpretation of Slave Ship, what Rankine's interpretation misses

|                                |               |                     |
|--------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|
| Page 4: [20] Commented [OMC12] | Olivia M. Cao | 12/19/25 9:36:00 AM |
|--------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|

Ceaselessness of experience of racial injustice on both macro and micro scale

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [21] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [21] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [21] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [22] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [22] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [22] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [22] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [22] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                                |               |                     |
|--------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|
| Page 7: [23] Commented [OMC22] | Olivia M. Cao | 12/19/25 3:19:00 PM |
|--------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|

Understanding of singular interpretations of painting is valuable but comprehensive understanding of multiple interpretations -- both within and outside of the context of Citizen -- is even more so.

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [24] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Custom Color( RGB(33,36,39) ), Pattern: Clear (White)

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [25] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Custom Color( RGB(33,36,39) ), Pattern: Clear (White)

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [26] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [27] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Custom Color(RGB(33,36,39)), Pattern: Clear (White)

|                                |               |                     |
|--------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|
| Page 7: [28] Commented [OMC23] | Olivia M. Cao | 12/19/25 3:20:00 PM |
|--------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|

Extend argument beyond analysis; greater call to action, lots of applicability for future engagement with arts and literature

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [29] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [29] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [30] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [31] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [32] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Auto, Ligatures: Standard + Contextual

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [33] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                      |               |                      |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 7: [33] Deleted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|----------------------|---------------|----------------------|

▼

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 8: [34] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Automatically adjust right indent when grid is defined, Adjust space between Latin and Asian text, Adjust space between Asian text and numbers

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 8: [35] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Normal, Level 2, Indent: First line: 0.5", Font Alignment: Auto

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 8: [36] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Default Paragraph Font, Font: +Body (Aptos), Font color: Black, Ligatures: None

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 8: [37] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font: 18 pt, Bold, Font color: Auto, Ligatures: None

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 8: [38] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Black, English (US), Ligatures: None

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 8: [39] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Default Paragraph Font, Font: +Body (Aptos), Font color: Black, English (US), Ligatures: None

|                        |               |                      |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Page 8: [40] Formatted | Olivia M. Cao | 12/14/25 10:40:00 AM |
|------------------------|---------------|----------------------|

Font color: Black, English (US), Ligatures: None